

5-2019

## Effects of Bilingual Education Programs on Elementary Latino English Language Learners

Linda Pinon Gutierrez  
*California State University, Monterey Bay*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps\\_thes\\_all](https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps_thes_all)



Part of the [Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons](#), [Elementary Education Commons](#), and the [Liberal Studies Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Pinon Gutierrez, Linda, "Effects of Bilingual Education Programs on Elementary Latino English Language Learners" (2019). *Capstone Projects and Master's Theses*. 546.  
[https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps\\_thes\\_all/546](https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps_thes_all/546)

This Capstone Project (Open Access) is brought to you for free and open access by the Capstone Projects and Master's Theses at Digital Commons @ CSUMB. It has been accepted for inclusion in Capstone Projects and Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ CSUMB. For more information, please contact [digitalcommons@csumb.edu](mailto:digitalcommons@csumb.edu).

*Effects of Bilingual Education Programs on  
Elementary Latino English Language Learners*

Linda J. Piñón Gutierrez

Spring 2019

**Senior Capstone**

Capstone Project Advisor: Paoze Thao

## **Abstract**

Throughout time, bilingual education supports native language and transfers that knowledge to learn a new language. However, it has radically changed throughout the decades in the United States. Many researchers argued that bilingual education is effective, while others debated that it is not. This capstone research project examines the effects of bilingual education programs on elementary Latino English language learners through the use of literature review, interviews with principals and teachers and anonymous survey with students in the Monterey Bay area. While bilingual education has been controversial, the findings of this senior capstone reveal that bilingual education has positive effects and fulfills the Latino English language learners' needs.

## **Introduction and Background**

Bilingual education has been a controversial topic in the United States. Bilingual education has evolved, developing different programs to help English Language Learners (ELL) to improve their native language and use it to learn English as well. I am interested in knowing which bilingual program has a significant effect on Latino English Language Learners. I wanted to find out how schools implement a bilingual program and what are the resources for schools to incorporate such bilingual program into their curriculum. I have benefited from bilingual education. I was in high school when I first was part of a bilingual program. In this research, my main focus is on the effects of bilingual education programs on Elementary Latino English Language Learners (ELL).

Bilingual education programs have changed over time due to politics, and the conclusions schools have towards the bilingual education. The bilingual education program has been beneficial for many people; some people might argue otherwise. Oppositions to the bilingual

program have caused heavy blows to the program. Limiting the use of the bilingual program in the hardest was proposition 227 (1998), which reduced bilingual classrooms in the schools. Despite the laws and oppositions to the bilingual education, the program marked an achievement again with proposition 58. As well as these propositions, there have been several in these years. The controversy with the bilingual education programs has been about convenient language, cultural identity, and the economy (Citrin, 2017).

Bilingual education does not mean the separation of two languages, and the idea goes beyond (Garcia, 2011). Schools that integrate a bilingual education program have a vision that goes beyond and recognizes the importance of languages and bilingualism in their students. In recent years, there has been an increase of ELL students that attend schools in the United States. Primarily, Latinos, whose primary language is Spanish, represent a higher percentage of public schools. Spanish was the home language of 3.7 million ELL students in fall 2015, representing 77.1 percent of all ELL students and 7.6 percent of all public K–12 students (U.S Department of Education, 2017). According to the U.S Department of Education (2017), the state of California is one of the states with 10% or higher of public school students who were ELL by Fall 2015.

Focusing at the elementary school level, from kindergarten through sixth grade reflect the importance of bilingual education programs in elementary schools. From kindergarten through third grade the percentage is higher — kindergarten with 16.3% ELL, first grade with 16.5%, and second grade with 16.0%. From fourth grade to sixth grade, the percentages start to decrease, from 12.2% to 8.2% English language learners at the elementary level. Even though many of these ELL students might be in an English-Only classroom, other ELL students might be part of a bilingual program. Although many ELL students are struggling in an English Only classroom.

The intentions for this research is to show how bilingual education programs are useful for children maintenance of their native language and their acquisition of the English language.

To find what effects bilingual education programs have and how they are being implemented for elementary Latino ELL in the Monterey Bay area the primary research question I aspire to answer is: How do bilingual education programs affect elementary Latino English language learners (ELL)? My secondary research questions are: What does research say about the effects of bilingual education programs on elementary Latino ELL students? Are there bilingual education programs that are effective for elementary Latino ELL students in the Monterey County area? If there are, how do they affect Latino ELL students? If the bilingual education programs are useful for Latino ELL students, how do schools implement them in the classrooms? What could schools do to improve the bilingual education programs for Latino ELL students? Are there resources for schools to incorporate bilingual education programs into their curriculum that would academically affect Latino ELL students?

### **Literature Review**

Throughout the history of bilingual education, the terms “bilingual education” have acquired different meanings. But in the United States, bilingual education has an expanded definition. The definition of bilingual education describes how “In educating equitably, bilingual education focuses on making schooling meaningful and comprehensible for the millions of children whose home languages are different from the dominant language of school and society” (Garcia, 2011, p. 35). As mentioned before, the terms “bilingual education” have been adapted in other countries for their academic purposes. “Bilingual education is different from traditional language education programs that teach a second or a foreign language. For the most part, these

traditional second or foreign-language programs teach the language as a subject, whereas bilingual education programs use the language as a medium of instruction”(Garcia, 2011, p.36).

The meaning of bilingual education in the U.S goes beyond learning one’s native language as a foreign language or a subject. “Bilingual education refers to education in more than one language, often encompassing more than two languages (Baker, 2001).” (Garcia, 2011, p.36-37). Because of the complexity surrounding bilingual education, many people misunderstand it. In the United States, for example, many people think that teaching immigrants using only English is bilingual education (Garcia, 2011, p.68-73). Just because a person’s native language is other than English and speaks it, does not mean that they have in-depth knowledge on the use of their native language. And putting Latino ELL students into English-Only classrooms implies that they provide adequate strategies or curriculum to teach non-English speakers.

The United States is the home of many languages. Many immigrants have come throughout history to the U.S from all over the world. This has caused many people to advocate for a better education for their children. There have also been many opponents of the bilingual program trying to implement English only, as the dominant language. Although, people have barely starting to realize that two languages are better than one. One of the most achievements for bilingual education was the Bilingual Act in 1968 when “Andersson, George Sánchez, and Joshua Fishman— ... realized [the importance of] equal educational opportunities for linguistic minorities, activism that eventually witnessed the passage of the Bilingual Education Act in 1968” (Ramsey, 2014, p.142).

With the Bilingual Education Act, bilingual education was about to change the life of many ELL students. However, bilingual education had always existed since the mid-1800s when

a wave of immigrants from all over the world started to arrive in the United States. But there were not strong laws to protect the bilingual education since there were not many people interested or representing the minorities who did not speak English. With the Bilingual Education Act, the bilingual education program started to have strength and development.

The Bilingual Education Act, which became Title VII of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act, laid the groundwork for the 1974 U.S. Supreme Court case *Lau v. Nichols*, in which the Court found that school districts must provide services for English-language learners. Although the Court did not explicitly mandate bilingual instruction, the U.S. Department of Health, Education, and Welfare— in its 1975 guidelines for the *Lau* decision— did recommend dual-language instruction for certain categories of English-language learners (Ramsey, 2014, p.142 ).

In recent years, there has been an increment in U.S schools of children whose primary language is not English, especially in California. This situation has changed the politics of language in California. The bilingual education program in California has a victory in referencing of language politics with Proposition 58 over Proposition 227. In 1998, Proposition 227 was passed, removing the bilingual program in public schools. “Proposition 227 stated that all public school instruction be conducted in English, with mandated English immersion for non-English speaking students after just one year” (Citrin, 2017, p.2).

On the other hand, “Proposition 58 eliminated this provision and the requirement that parents had to seek a waiver to opt out of English-only programs. It allowed for dual immersion instruction on an ongoing basis, and it also allowed for further changes in the new law to be made by the legislature alone” (Citrin, 2017, p.2). As a result, different types of bilingual programs have emerged. This project will help to be aware of the methods most used at schools and how they are effective for English Language Learners. As Ofelia Garcia states “Bilingual education in the twenty-first century must be reimagined and expanded, as it takes its rightful place as a meaningful way to educate all children and language learners in the world today”

(p.43). This research will help teachers to understand the importance of making changes in traditional teaching for ELL. Consequently, by learning the effects of the bilingual education used in schools, this will provide adequate instruction to ELL and embrace their intellectuality in both languages.

There are considered four strong forms of bilingual education, which are: Immersion, Maintenance/Heritage Language, Two-Way/ Dual Language, and Mainstream Bilingual. All these types of bilingual education have a common language outcome for ELL students, which are bilingualism and biliteracy. On the other hand, weak forms of bilingual education are seven: Submersion (Structured Immersion), Submersion with withdrawal classes/sheltered English, Segregationists, Transitional, Mainstream with Foreign Language Teaching, and Separatists. All these forms of weak bilingual education have a poor language outcome, which is monolingualism because they focus on either language only.

The positive effects of bilingual education programs on Latino ELL students are that it makes it easier for students to learn a second language. “Children who are exposed to a bilingual education pick up that second language much faster than an adult (Ayres, 2019). Another positive outcome of the bilingual education program is that it provides ELL students future opportunities because “Being fluent in two languages instead of one provides numerous professional opportunities to the modern worker. Learning the second language while still in school sets up a child to take advantage of those opportunities when they are ready to pursue a vocational path... a language differential can add up to 20% to a worker’s salary per year” (Ayres, 2019). Besides students learning two languages and how they work at the same time, students are improving their brain and memory. “A bilingual education can also enhance a



child's working memory. This improvement provides for better processing capabilities when exposed to new sounds, new concepts, and new experiences. (Ayres, 2019).

On the other hand, some of the challenges that the bilingual program faces is that the bilingual education for ELL students can be inconsistent. This means that the program is offered to some grade levels. Some school districts stop their bilingual education in high school. Some school districts don't offer a bilingual education as an option. Because of this inconsistency, some students may lose some of their second language abilities merely because they aren't using it every day. For a bilingual education to be effective, it must continue throughout the career of the students who choose to participate in it (Ayres, 2019).

Another challenge that the bilingual education program have is that learning a specific content can be difficult. For example, if the student did not comprehend the material in Spanish, the ELL student probably is going to have difficulty transferring that knowledge into English. Although "Many districts that offer a bilingual education teach one language for half the day and the other language for the remainder of the day. If a student is struggling with division and is also struggling with second-language grammatical concepts, it could be a negative impact on their education" (Ayres, 2019). Also, the bilingual program has lack of BCLAD certified teachers. Meaning that there are not enough teachers prepared to substitute or teach Latino ELL students. Also, there is a lack of qualified. The bilingual education program needs "...teachers and teaching assistants who are fluent in both languages being taught" (Ayres, 2019). Not only teachers have to be proficient in both languages, but they have to be able to develop and adapt the curriculum for their ELL students.

Common core does not affect the bilingual education program since the curriculum is provided in both languages, English and Spanish. But the No Child Left Behind Legislation does have an impact on ELL students, especially Latino ELL students. Some of the effects that the legislation had on the bilingual education program are that teachers

started to worried about the testing and started to increase the instruction in English. “In the wake of the federal No Child Left Behind legislation, standardized tests have become increasingly high-stakes. English language learners (ELLs) typically score far below native English speakers, creating pressure to “teach to the test.” Most schools and individual educators have increased the amount of English instruction ELLs receive; however, some have instead increased native language instruction as a test preparation strategy. Curriculum and instruction focus on test content and strategies, and English as a second language classes have become more like English language arts classes for native English speakers. In bilingual classes, tests are found to promote monolingual instruction with test translations guiding decisions about language allocation (Menken, 2006, p.521).

As mentioned before, the legislation of No Child Left Behind lead to teachers to teach to the test, using less time for ELL students’ instruction in their native language. In other words, “...ELLs are disproportionately being “left behind,” performing far below native English speakers on standardized tests. The findings from this research expose how the national emphasis on testing dramatically impacts the ways that ELLs are educated in U.S. public schools today, to meet the demands of high-stakes testing” (Menken, 2006, p.521). Although, bilingual education still providing support to ELL students. Some school districts are or were not affected as much in their bilingual education programs. This is important for people, teachers, leaders, principals, parents to take into consideration since one thing can affect an entire community either positively or negatively.

### **Methods and Procedures**

After I chose my topic for my senior capstone research project, I needed to find different sources of information to complete this project. With the help of my professor, Dr. Thao, I was able to organize my ideas to start working on my senior capstone research project. To answer my primary and secondary questions for my topic, I found academic information through books; peer-reviewed journals, articles, and websites. After looking through these sources, I was able to obtain information related to my topic and my research questions. After obtaining literature

information, I went to my community in the Monterey Bay area, and I visited five elementary schools. These five elementary schools have mostly Latino ELL students, which Spanish is their native language. The purpose of the visits was to interview and obtain direct information from schools that implement a bilingual education program. I interviewed five principals and five teachers, and I also conducted an anonymous survey for students in three different classrooms. The anonymous student surveys were given to a first-grade bilingual class, and the rest to two third grade classrooms.

The interviews and surveys intend to observe if the bilingual education implemented in schools works for elementary Latino English Language Learners. The questions for the principals' interview (Appendix A) include the capstone research project questions. The principals were interviewed first because most of the time, they are busy, and it is hard to find a chance to meet with them. The four of the principals I interviewed, work in schools where bilingual education programs are implemented. One of the principals worked at an English-Only school but has experience working at a bilingual school. Four of these principals have ten to twenty years of experience, and one has six years of experience. Some of them had taught bilingual education before they became principals. The importance of interviewing principals is that they lead the school and advocate for their school's needs.

After interviewing the principals, the teachers were interviewed. The questionnaire for the teachers' interviews (Appendix B) included as well the capstone research questions. The five teachers interviewed are bilingual teachers in an elementary school. The primary language of their students is Spanish. These teachers have between ten to twenty years of teaching experience, especially implementing the bilingual program. These five teachers are from two

different schools, two of them are kindergarten teachers, two of them are third-grade teachers, and one is a first-grade teacher.

Also, there was distributed an anonymous student survey (Appendix C). The anonymous student surveys were in both languages, English and Spanish for students' language preference or better understanding. The surveys were hard copies and were given to the first-grade teacher, and to the two third grade teachers to give them to their students. The reason for the anonymous student surveys were given to first and third graders was to see the different effects that the bilingual education program has on different grade levels.

### **Results and Discussion**

After the interviews with the principals and teachers as part of the research methods and procedures, the secondary questions of this capstone research project were answered based on their professional and academic experience besides the literature review. The results indicate that Bilingual Education has positive effects on Latino English Language Learners. *What does research say about the effects of bilingual education programs on elementary Latino ELL students?* "... (Bilingual Education Programs) foster and develop tolerance towards linguistic differences, as well as the appreciation of languages and bilingual proficiency" (Garcia, 2011, p.37). The bilingual education program benefits Latino ELL students in many different ways. According to teacher 1 responses, the bilingual education program gradually releases the student into their second language meaning that in lower grades most of the teaching language is in their native language (Spanish). The bilingual program allows Latino ELL students to be biliterate, which helps them in their future careers. Another positive effect of the bilingual education program is that it will enable ELL students to better comprehend new content by accessing different schemas in their brain.

*Are there bilingual education programs that are effective for elementary Latino ELL students in the Monterey County area? If there are, how do they affect Latino ELL students?* In the Monterey County area, the most implemented bilingual programs are Dual Language Immersion, One Way Immersion, and Bilingual Transference. The Dual Language Immersion program consists of implementing the two languages; in this case, English and Spanish. The instruction is in both languages with the same amount of time; this method is known as 50:50. As mentioned before in the literature review section, this type of bilingual program is considered to be a strong form of bilingual education with a positive language outcome of bilingualism and biliteracy in both languages for Latino ELL students.

One Way Immersion is implemented for all grades but mostly lower grades at the elementary level, kinder-third grade (k-3rd), kinder to second grade (k-2nd), or first-third grade (1st-3rd), depending on the school. The One Way Immersion Program maintains a ratio of 80:20, where the program uses the native language of the student 80% of the time and 20% of English as the language of instruction. This program uses the students' native language as the language of instruction and English is used only for language arts. The goal of this program is for students to become proficient and academically prepared in their native language as well as English. The program increases to more English as the language of instruction in upper grades with 60:40. This means that 60% of the instruction is English, and 40% is taught in Spanish.

Bilingual Transference education, which is known as using the students' native language as the language of instruction. But also, what they learn in Spanish they would eventually learn the same thing in English. Bilingual Transference education uses scald folding. Spanish is used as the language of instruction at the beginning of the school year. At the end of the year, the

amount of time used in the classroom is equal in both languages. But most of are taught in English at the end of the year.

*If the bilingual education programs are useful for Latino ELL students, how do schools implement them in the classroom?* According to the teachers' responses, the implementation of effective instruction in the classrooms depends on different reasons. One of the reasons is the teacher's preparation. A lot of teachers have to have bilingual authorization. The bilingual authorization prepares teachers to have in-depth knowledge of the Spanish language and how to use it academically with ELL students. Although, some school districts provide a coach who provides strategies and ways to help ELL students. The schools who do not have a coach, have a teacher in each grade level to plan things accordingly and assist the other teachers in what they need. Also, teachers have a week of training. They are taught different strategies in English, which can transfer to Spanish. In this trainings, experienced teachers can share their strategies and methods they use for English Language Learners. The school district provides different materials such as online links to resources for activities, but there is not enough material in Spanish.

Another crucial secondary question of this capstone research paper was: *What could schools do to improve the bilingual education programs for Latino ELL students?* The five interviewed teachers who are the ones in charge of the classroom, and the teaching had similar responses. Teacher 2 argued that she had thirty-one (31) students. In order to improve the bilingual education program for Latino ELL students, it would be convenient to reduce class size. Teacher 1 stated that in order to have a successful and effective bilingual education it is necessary to prepare teachers to successfully teach in a bilingual setting is a must. The reason is that many teachers go into the profession but do not know how the Spanish language works.

Providing professional development for teachers would be a great idea. Teacher 1 recommends that all teachers should be BCLAD (bilingual authorization) certified to teach high rich language in Spanish.

Teacher 3 suggested that bilingual education should make the program for all grade levels, not only lower grade levels (K-3rd). Teacher 3 believes that barely in lower grade levels, students are acquiring the basics of their native language. When they are put into English Only classroom in the upper grades (4th-6th), what Latino ELL students have learned in their native language does not continue to develop. Teacher 4 mentioned the same thing but added that in order for the bilingual program to expand it is required to inform parents about what is the bilingual program for Latino ELL students to keep and learn both languages as they advance grade level. Teacher 5 that for the bilingual program to be effective for Latino ELL students, teachers have to teach the program as it is. In other words, using time wisely, following the curriculum and asking for help if they need it. Principal 1 added that the bilingual education program can succeed now that students are given technology. Technology such as Chromebooks to take home with, teachers should assign programs or activities that help Latino ELL students outside school.

*Are there resources for schools to incorporate bilingual education programs into their curriculum that would academically affect Latino ELL students?* Principals and teachers explained that the district provides the curriculum in Spanish, some library books in Spanish compared to English books. The school district also provides training in English which can also be used in Spanish. Technology, in which teachers can find academic videos in Spanish. There is a program called “I Pilot”, in which students work individually on phonics and phonemic awareness in both languages (English and Spanish). Other resources for the bilingual education

program is the curriculum in both English and Spanish. Although teachers have to translate and create their own activities. Also for ELL students who still struggle in their native language as well as in English. The combination of these resources makes it easier for Latino ELL students to succeed academically in their native language and English.

The anonymous student surveys reaffirmed about the language spoken at home, which was Spanish and that the language they speak with their friends in both English and Spanish. The anonymous student surveys were given in both languages. However, since this anonymous student survey was given to Latino ELL first grade students and third-grade students, it was noticeable how the first graders choose to look at the questions in Spanish answer than in English. In contrast with third graders in the bilingual program, one class answered the survey was looking at the questions in both languages. The other class each student choose either English or Spanish. What this proved is that as Latino ELL students advance grade level within the bilingual program, they become biliterate.

### **Recommendations**

Therefore, according to the information gathered from academic sources and personal communication with principals and teachers, I think that for the bilingual education program to continue having an effective impact on Latino English Language Learners it is necessary to consider four things. First, schools should expand the bilingual program for all grade levels, not only lower grade levels. The most recommended bilingual education programs from principals and teachers of the Monterey Bay area was the Dual Immersion bilingual program. Teachers should be provided with more resources in Spanish. Probably bilingual teachers from around the area should exchange and share what they have done to facilitate teachers' instruction. Another recommendation is to reduce class size requires schools to expand their program to either more



bilingual classrooms for the same grade level. However, bilingual teachers should be BCLAD certified. Teachers with a bilingual authorization would be prepared to assist students in any circumstance as well as to develop and adapt the curriculum for effectiveness.

### **Problems and Limitations**

After collecting the information for my capstone research project primary and secondary questions, I was able to gather the information needed. But, it was difficult to schedule the appointments with the principals to interview them. Also, finding time to interview teachers was challenging since they have meetings before or after school, they have to lesson plan. For one teacher interview, I had to come back the next day since the teacher had to go to an unexpected meeting. Time was crucial, and one of my limitations to carry out this research project. Another limitation that I had was that the schools I visited and the participants were from the same school district. Also, anonymous student surveys distributed within one school, and only three classes participated in the anonymous student survey. Although, the information acquired from anonymous surveys just reaffirmed the information obtained from the literature review and the principal and teacher questions. Another limitation was that the bilingual education program in these schools was limited from K/1st-3rd grade. I think it would have been good to see the impact of the bilingual education program in upper-grade levels.

Although I faced some challenges while doing my research, I was able to obtain the information needed to testify my arguments about the effects of bilingual education programs of Latino English Language Learners.

### **Conclusion**

Regardless of the challenges and oppositions the bilingual program education faces, the outcomes are effective for Latino ELL. Throughout the information obtained in the literature

review, principal and teacher interviews, I have expanded my knowledge on what are the effects of bilingual education programs on Latino ELL students. It is important to remember that the information obtained from the principal and teacher interviews do not represent the bilingual education program in all the state or nation. However, the literature review shows how bilingual education programs help Latino ELL students whose primary language is Spanish to succeed academically in both languages, English and Spanish. The preparation and experience of the principals and teachers, help the bilingual education program to develop and adapt the curriculum for Latino ELL students. Although, teachers still struggle to find resources to provide qualitative instruction. The bilingual education program uses Latino ELL students' native language as the medium of instruction. This method is useful to transfer knowledge learned in Spanish to English. With the understanding of both languages, English and Spanish would bring future personal, academic, and professional opportunities. To make possible the success of Latino ELL students, it is necessary to expand the bilingual education program at least to all grade levels on elementary schools.

## References

- Ayres, C. (n.d.). 14 Pros and Cons of Bilingual Education. Retrieved from <https://vittana.org/14-pros-and-cons-of-bilingual-education>
- Bilingual education in the 21st century: A global perspective.* (2011). Retrieved from <https://ebookcentral.proquest.com>
- Boyd-Batstone, P. (2015). *Helping english language learners meet the common core: Assessment and instructional strategies k-12*. Place of publication not identified: Routledge.
- Brisk, M. E. (2005). *Bilingual education : From compensatory to quality schooling*. Retrieved from <https://ebookcentral.proquest.com>
- Citrin, J., Levy, M., & Wong, C. J. (2017). Politics and the english language in california: Bilingual education at the polls. *California Journal of Politics and Policy*, 9(2).
- De Ramirez, Romilia Dominguez, & Shapiro, Edward S. (2006). Curriculum-Based Measurement and the Evaluation of Reading Skills of Spanish-Speaking English Language Learners in Bilingual Education Classrooms. *School Psychology Review*, 35(3), 356-369.
- Dragan, P. B. (2005). *A how-to guide for teaching english language learners in the primary classroom*. Portsmouth: Heinemann.
- Flores, B., Sheets, R., & Clark, E. (2010). Teacher preparation for bilingual student populations: *Educar para transformar*. New York ; London: Routledge.
- McCarty, S. (2012). Understanding Bilingual Education 2: Analyzing Types of Bilingual Education. Retrieved from [https://www.childresearch.net/papers/language/2012\\_02.html](https://www.childresearch.net/papers/language/2012_02.html).

- Menken, K. (2006). Teaching to the Test: How No Child Left Behind Impacts Language Policy, Curriculum, and Instruction for English Language Learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 30(2), 521-546.
- ONE-WAY IMMERSION PROGRAMS. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.resources.gocabe.org/index.php/home/programs/one-way-immersion-programs/>
- Orosco, M., & O'connor, R. (2014). Culturally Responsive Instruction for English Language Learners With Learning Disabilities. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 47(6), 515-531.
- Rodriguez, D., Carrasquillo, A., & Lee, K. S. (2014). *The bilingual advantage: Promoting academic development, biliteracy, and native language in the classroom*. New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University.
- Snow, C. E., & Freedson-Gonzales, M. (2003). Bilingualism, Second Language Learning, and English as a Second Language. In J. W. Guthrie (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Education* (2nd ed., Vol. 1, pp. 181-185). New York, NY: Macmillan Reference USA.
- Tucker, J. (2016). Bilingual Education in California Has Been Successful. In N. Merino (Ed.), *At Issue. Bilingual Education*. Farmington Hills, MI: Greenhaven Press. (Reprinted from S.F. Seen as Model in Bilingual Education over English Only, *San Francisco Chronicle*, 2014).
- Valdés, G., Menken, K., & Castro, M. (2015). Common core, bilingual and English language learners: A resource for educators.
- Valdés, G. (2001). *Learning and Not Learning English*. New York: Teacher College Press, Columbia University.

**Appendix 1**  
**Principal Interview**

- 1) Do you think the bilingual program implemented in this school is effective for ELL? Why?
  
- 2) If such Bilingual education Program is effective, how does the school implement such program in the classroom?
  
- 3) Why do you think it is important to incorporate bilingual education programs?
  
- 4) Are there resources for school to incorporate bilingual education programs into the curriculum?
  
- 5) What are some of the challenges that the bilingual education program might faced in the future? (Like in the year 1998)
  
- 6) With proposition 58, are schools allow to implement bilingual education on English- Only classrooms? How? why?or Must these two maintain separate?
  
- 7) How does State Standards and/ or Common Core Standards affect the bilingual curriculum?
  
- 8) What are the effects of No Child Left Behind on ELL students?
  
- 9) What could the school do to improve the bilingual education program for ELL students?

**Appendix 2**  
**Teacher Interview Questions**

- 1) How do you think the bilingual program benefits English Language Learner students?
  
- 2) What are the effects of the bilingual program on English Language Learners in your classroom?
  
- 3) Are there any sources provided by the bilingual program and how you implement them in your classroom?
  
- 4) How are teachers prepared to implement the bilingual program?
  
- 5) Why do you think it is important to incorporate bilingual education programs?
  
- 6) What are some of the challenges you face as a bilingual teacher?
  
- 7) How does State Standards and/ or Common Core Standards affect the bilingual curriculum? What about No Child Left Behind?
  
- 8) Why do you think is important to use the native language of students to learn English?
  
- 9) Do you think English Only classrooms are more effective for Latino ELL?
  
- 10) What would you change to improve the bilingual education program for Latino ELL students?

**Appendix 3**  
**Anonymous Student Survey Questions**

1) Do you feel that using Spanish in class helps you understand what you are learning in class?  
Yes    No

2) What language do you feel comfortable speaking?  
English      Spanish      Both

3) What language do you feel comfortable writing?  
English      Spanish      Both

4) What language do you feel comfortable reading?  
English      Spanish      Both

5) What language do you use with your friends at school?  
English      Spanish      Both

6) What language do you use with your siblings?  
English      Spanish      Both

7) What language do you use with your parents?  
English      Spanish      Both

8) Do you think it is important to use both English and Spanish?  
Yes    No

9) How would you like your class to be, in English or Spanish or both?  
English      Spanish      Both

10) Do you like how your teacher uses both English and Spanish?  
Yes    No

11) What is your opinion on using both English and Spanish in the classroom? Please explain.

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Appendix 3**  
**Anonymous Student Survey Questions (Spanish)**

1. ¿Sientes que usar español en clase te ayuda a comprender lo que estás aprendiendo?  
Si      No
2. ¿Qué idioma te sientes cómodo hablando?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
3. ¿Qué idioma te sientes cómodo escribiendo?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
4. ¿Qué idioma te sientes cómodo leyendo?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
5. ¿Qué idioma hablas con tus amigos en la escuela?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
6. ¿Qué idioma hablas con tus hermanos?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
7. ¿Qué idioma hablas con tus padres?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
8. ¿Crees que es importante usar ambos idiomas, inglés y español?  
Si      No
9. ¿Cómo te gustaría que fuera tu clase, en inglés, español o ambos?  
Inglés      Español      Ambos
10. ¿Te gusta cómo tu maestro/ maestra usa inglés y español en clase?  
Si      No
- 11) ¿Cuál es tu opinión sobre el uso de inglés y español en el salón de clase? Por favor explique.

---

---

---

---

---

---