

5-2020

Transnational and Local NGO Collaboration for Domestic Worker Advocacy in Singapore

Ariana Lester
California State University, Monterey Bay

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps_thes_all

Recommended Citation

Lester, Ariana, "Transnational and Local NGO Collaboration for Domestic Worker Advocacy in Singapore" (2020). *Capstone Projects and Master's Theses*. 844.
https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps_thes_all/844

This Capstone Project (Open Access) is brought to you for free and open access by the Capstone Projects and Master's Theses at Digital Commons @ CSUMB. It has been accepted for inclusion in Capstone Projects and Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ CSUMB. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@csumb.edu.

TRANSNATIONAL AND LOCAL NGO COLLABORATION FOR DOMESTIC WORKER
ADVOCACY IN SINGAPORE

Ariana Lester
Global Studies 445: Capstone Seminar
May 15, 2020

Introduction

In 2010 my parents moved our family to Singapore. I was in the sixth grade. Over time, my family and I started to notice the stark contrast in the treatment of the different classes. At the top were the wealthy local and expats and at the bottom were the unskilled migrant workers. Domestic helpers in particular were treated as second class citizens. I witnessed the mistreatment of these women while working as domestic helpers. I noticed that unlike other countries there was no visible public advocacy for them, neither from individuals nor organizations. I decided to research why foreign domestic workers experienced exploitation and abuse without any intervention from local advocacy groups. When it came time to write my capstone, I focused on the restrictive nature of Singapore's government on local advocacy groups.

Foreign domestic workers are important transient workers who are found nearly all over the globe and are significant economic contributors. The International Labour Organization (ILO) estimates that there are 11.5 million domestic workers with around forty percent working in the Asia-Pacific region, "of which eighty percent are women" (HOME, 2019). Foreign domestic workers are economic contributors to both the host country and their home country. These women make significant impacts back home, foreign domestic workers employed in Singapore, Malaysia and Hong Kong have collectively sent money back home in the amount of 1.1 Billion dollars to both the Philippines and Indonesia (Experian). This money has contributed to overall poverty reductions in their home countries. Foreign domestic workers are a part of a global network of transient women many of whom experience abuse and exploitation due policies in place. In Singapore, nearly 261,800 domestic workers, primarily from the Philippines, are vulnerable to exploitation and are barred for self-advocacy.

Singapore's one-party government restricts civil society and represses advocacy. Singapore's government utilizes a registry with specific limitations and media blockers which render local actors ineffective. This is particularly problematic for migrant laborers who have few and weak protections. Bal (2015) exemplifies how Singapore's one-party authoritative rule (PAP) has created a "near-absolute lack of opportunity" for NGOs and other civil society actors to create effective changes to the spheres of previously defined 'off limit' topics (Bal 2015, 221). In order to address this, local NGOs must connect with transnational organizations to pressure the government to act. Having local Singaporean NGOs contributing information to transnational actors on foreign domestic workers strengthens the coalition of migrant rights as a whole.

I will argue that effective advocacy for foreign domestic workers in Singapore can be accomplished by circumventing the state's stranglehold on civil society, utilizing a collaboration between local and transnational non-governmental organizations. I will go over in this essay the constraints of advocacy in Singaporean civil society, the importance of collaboration between transnational local NGOs as well as showcase their effective campaigns that contributed to the reduction of foreign domestic worker abuse and exploitation. I will do this by highlighting how the advocacy activities of two Singaporean NGOs Transient Workers Count Too (TWC2) and the Humanitarian Organization for Migration Economics (HOME) have networked with transnational feminist networks, UNWomen and Arming Women Against Rape & Endangerment (AWARE) to bring about change for foreign domestic workers in Singapore. This resulted in three significant changes to Singapore's response to migrant labor: The Evidence Act and Criminal Procedure Code amendment (2012), the passing of The Human Trafficking Act (2015) and implementation of National Workers Safety and Health (WSH) Strategy (2018).

What makes Singapore an interesting case worth analyzing is that it is unlike other developed countries. Local NGOs in non-authoritarian states can implement small changes in codes and policies on all topics. To make instrumental and central changes to policy they collaborate with transnational and global organizations. Singapore does not allow for local NGOs to advocate for issues that revolve around any taboo topics. Local NGOs have to collaborate with transnational organizations to make small changes. Central policies created by the Singaporean government have yet to be challenged. The local and transnational collaboration is the only effective way to advocate for foreign domestic workers in Singapore's restricted civil society. While this avenue has not yet been effective in central policies that contribute to exploitation of foreign domestic workers, it has brought pressure on the Singaporean government to amend smaller codes in relation to improved oversight of these workers. The slow encroaching pressure of NGOs from the international level has made way for positive policy changes in future and continuous attempts.

Theoretical Framework

In order to understand why migrant laborers in Singapore face obstacles in advocating for their rights, the nature of civil society must be unpacked. Civil society as defined by Tay (1998) is the institutions and arrangements that lie within the space between the state and people. This includes organizations that allow for the people to organize; all clubs, societies, and associations meant to push for common interests (Tay 1998, 244). Civil society is where organized groups, such as non-governmental organizations, operate to work to ensure the needs of the people are being met where the government has failed to ensure.

There are multiple theories of civil society, it has been divided between “two debated sides, West and Asia” (Tay 1998, 246). The “Western” view of civil society restricts the political sphere over “social and cultural duties” leaving civil society to pick up the sectors where the government has abandoned (Tay 1998, 246). Singapore has supported the “Asian” position that civil society is used to foster “democratic culture” and should be protected by the government to ensure the safety of their democracy (Tay 1998, 246). This position fosters the idea of regulatory system

Political advocacy has been a new phenomenon in Singapore since the 1990s. In hegemonic states such as Singapore, the state allows for the rise in one coalition over the others with a set of controls like Out-of-Bound markers (OB markers)¹ and policies that can dismantle the organization². Singapore uses repressive strategies that to impose self-regulatory measures on these organizations, local NGOs are forced to be compliant for face consequences that can included the dismantling of the organization by the government. (Lee 2002; Ortmann 2012). These organizations become largely ineffective as their powers are limited to an agenda setting that is closely regulated by the ruling party. Ortmann (2012) contrasts this with the Advocacy

¹ Out-of-bound markers (OB) are a set of restrictions. Non-governmental organizations must register under the Societies Act where they are forced to comply with restrictions that the PAP deems non disruptive to their civil society. This includes keeping organizations away from topics that are taboo under the current societal conditions. the PAP has not publicly announced foreign domestic workers abuse to be 'of-limits' yet organizations and their members that have worked to advocate and protect domestic workers have been prosecuted.

² When organization opt to advocate on the behalf of foreign domestic workers the government has, in the past, seen to the arrest of members of nongovernmental organization members under the Internal Security Act claiming that the organization threatened national interests. Although this was an extreme case PAP has also seen to the absorption or replacement of independent labor unions into government agencies rendering them ineffective in the plight of domestic workers rights. They use the face of these organizations to make a false front for the government's hand in advocacy for underrepresented groups.

Coalition Framework which occurs when different advocacy groups with similar values cooperate to assert policy change. This happens only if these actors are given room to compete and collaborate with one another in a liberal democratic context.

Civil society is a local space that is controlled by individuals and or organizations residing within the country. With Singapore's authoritative constraint on this space comes the inability for local actors to make constructive changes to political structures and policies. The need for the expansion into global society is paramount for advocacy in authoritative environments since international organizations reside in this space. In global civil society there is no one government in control which gives organizations the freedom to advocate. In the global society, international organizations have been increasingly more prevalent in the shaping of national and international policy by using networks that are "significant transnationally and domestically" (Keck and Sikkink 1998, 139). Transnational non-governmental organizations (TNGOs) shape the world particularly human rights and humanitarian aid (Mitchell and Schmitz 2014, 487). TNGOs are actors that create a global norm that they institutionalize through their collaborations with local actors (Mitchell and Schmitz 2014, 488). Activism has historically been linked to collaborations across borders, yet with the onset of globalization these connections have increased. In recent years this has led to TNGOs promoting change through the involvement of local organizations (Ng 2018, 1095).

Transnational advocacy creates links between local actors, civil societies, states and international organizations that allow for a multi channeled system that is effective (Keck and Sikkink 1998, 139). What makes this form of organizing unique is the non-traditional strategic mobilization of information. This information then can be utilized by gaining leverage and applying pressure over governments and powerful organizations (Keck and Sikkink 1998, 157).

The leverage is gained through framing the issues and making it “comprehensible to target audiences, to attract attention and encourage action” (Keck and Sikkink 1998, 157).

Lyons (2005) examines the freedom that comes with NGOs working within the informal sector of Singaporean society. She moves away from local to global in the context of diasporic political activism. She highlights that “foreign-based NGOs [have] have always found it difficult to operate on the ground” but by utilizing transnational links to local informal organizations that work without the constraints of Singaporean law, activism can flourish (Lyons 2005, 216). She uses The Workers Committee 2 later renamed as Transient Workers Count Too (TWC2) as an example of how local actors have found ways to work around the system by not formally registering with the Societies Act by limiting its existence to one year. They became more effective in their continual fight for migrant workers’ rights. TWC2 does not ‘openly engage with activists across borders, they clearly engage with other types of transnational actors as well as transnational ideas, ncluding international human rights discourse (Lyons 2005, 238). Gomez illustrates the importance of the “frequency of information circulated by external advocacy groups on Singapore”, as the limitation for local actors has rendered their contribution virtually ineffective (Gomez 2005, 198). Through these transnational channels Gomez (2005) has concluded that it is paramount to the discussion to include ‘international and regional civil society groups’ as they have contributed to the changing of policy.

Methodology

This project uses mixed methods to understand the use of local and transnational advocacy to improve foreign domestic worker’s rights. The time period in which this research lies is from the late 1990’s to the late 2010s. The research conducted used secondary materials,

humanitarian organization data reports, as well as scholarly interpretations of national statistical data. These sources aided in describing the Singaporean state, the importance of foreign domestic workers and their lack of agency and the actions required to promote their rights.

Findings and Analysis

Problem case: Pressing for Unskilled Migrant Rights in Singapore

More than 200,000 foreign domestic workers hold permits within Singapore and are actively working. This accounts for one in five households hiring a foreign domestic worker. While within these households, they face wage and hour exploitation, physical and psychological abuse, and inadequate housing accommodations. These women face abuse on account of their gender, temporary status and the requirement that they live within their employer's residence. The abusive and exploitative nature of this line of work is a direct result of policy structures as well as social attitude toward the service class. Foreign domestic worker exploitation is perpetrated by employers and agencies due to the lack of proper guidelines and their exclusion from the Employment Act which only protects Singaporeans and skilled workers.

Singapore has a shortage of local manpower (Thangavelu 2017, 724). This small city-state with a population of 5.7 million relies on foreign labor for development and economic growth. Its large number of migrant workers has an overall positive effect on the economy as it frees up skilled workers to perform jobs that will bring more capital (Nowrasteh 2018, 23). Foreign labor almost completely fills the domestic worker sector, they uphold the homestead which allows Singaporean residents leave the home to work and contribute to the economy. There are about 1.7 million migrant workers in Singapore making up thirty-eight percent of the population, although some of these migrants are professionals, bankers and business executives,

seventy-six percent are unskilled workers who hold worker permits: Employment Pass, S Pass, Foreign Domestic Worker, or Work Permit (Nowrasteh 2018, 7). Foreign domestic workers have contributed 8.2 billion US dollars to the Singaporean GDP. That number is expected to rise. According to a 2019 study conducted by Frost & Sullivan, the number of foreign domestic workers employed in Singapore and Hong Kong will increase by 50,000-75,000 due to an aging population. Foreign domestic workers are an important part of Singapore's growth and should reap the benefits of working in a developed country with laws that seek to foster a safe and abuse free work environment.

Migrant labor in Singapore consists of two groups: skilled, which require a degree or accredited certification, and unskilled labor, which require neither. A migrant's rights are dependent upon whether or they are skilled or unskilled. Singaporeans and skilled workers are covered by the Employment Act which stipulates strict rules hours, working conditions, and treatment. The Singaporean government's Ministry of Manpower (MOM) oversees the treatment of those under the Employment Act and are to take action when rights are violated. Skilled laborers are able to apply for residency and work toward their citizenship as they are seen by the Singaporean government as valuable additions to their society and economy. Unskilled workers are protected under the Employment of Foreign Manpower Act (EFMA) which uses ambiguous language like 'acceptable' accommodation[s], 'adequate' food, 'adequate' rest, and 'reasonable' notice of repatriation" (HOME 2018, 3). The policy is meant for the agencies and the employers of unskilled workers to follow. They are held accountable for maintaining the rights of their employees as the government takes a hands-off approach to this level of migrant labor. It is common for agencies and employers to manipulate the language in the policy to their own benefit to create abusive and exploitative work environments for unskilled labor. Unskilled

laborers are barred from residency and are kept on temporary visas that are contingent on their continued employment through their agency. Their temporary status also makes it so that they cannot hold an appointment with any official within the government and the only ways that they may petition the government is through a third party like a registered non-governmental organization or their agency.

Migrant workers – particularly unskilled workers such as domestic helpers – have limited powers of self-advocacy as they are not able to protest and are barred from holding meetings with public officials in the countries of employment. The only way for them to improve their current working conditions is to address this with their employers and or agencies that hired them. This is rarely a valid option as raising complaints leads many to be sent back to home countries since the supply of migrants wanting to work in their home country is higher than the demand. Low skill migrant workers are easily replaceable and by raising concerns, they risk job security. Since these workers have no avenues for self-advocacy, they require organizational advocacy, at the local, transnational and global level. Unlike skilled workers who can apply for residency in Singapore, low skilled laborers are protected under a different set of policies that do not allow them to apply for residency. Residency allows for skilled workers to have the option of working toward their Singaporean citizenship which allows them even more powers of advocacy.

Limitations of Advocacy of Local NGOs in Singapore

Singapore is on a hegemonic one-party system that does not allow NGOs and social organizations to make a significant political impact. They allow a small number of groups that have been registered under the Societies Act to set small political agendas that do not threaten

the People's Action Party (PAP). Organizations like the Association of Women for Action and Research have been able to monopolize the NGO arena as they work within the out-of-bound markers (OB markers) and do not challenge the PAP's authority. They have stayed non-threatening and have not moved to impact the state of civil society. Singapore's civil society has been controlled by the PAP as they saw this as a space that could not self-regulate (Teng, Soon and Koh 2014). The Society Act is the registry to account for all NGOs working in the country. Those organizations must follow OB markers or are shut down. The PAP uses this registry to keep track of organizations to make sure that they are not stirring up unrest in the country or shining a negative light on the regime. In the past organizations tackling issues that fall under the OB markers have been dismantled and members have been arrested under the assumption that they are a threat to the security of the country, legalized through the Internal Security Act (ISA).

Singapore uses other tools to limit and regulate civil society; this includes the media. Media is an important part of civil society as it allows for individuals or organizations to create and share content that they find important knowledge for the population. It is a tool to rally support for specific causes or highlight important issues that need to be addressed by the government or population. Singapore has created a system of media censorship. This is used to ensure that media does not foster opposition to the current authoritative one-party government (Rodan 1998, 72). Media can be broken down into three parts, the first of which is broadcast media. Singapore has made calculated methods to restrict and censor media that revolves around political engagement. To meet domestic demand for international television, the government created Cable TV run by Singapore Cable Vision (SCV) which is comprised of mainly state run companies Singapore International Media (31 percent), Singapore Technologies Venture (24 percent), Singapore Press Holdings (20 percent) and a United States based cable operator

Continental Cablevision (25 percent) (Rodan 1998, 72). International media outlets eager to enter the emerging market self-censor their content that is broadcasted to meet Singapore's standards. Second is the Internet, which has been a catalyst for democratic revolution in advocacy campaigns around the world (Lee 2010, 106). To hinder this process the PAP introduced online content censorship, legislative measures and surveillance techniques (Lee 2010, 106). Starting in 1995, the Singapore Broadcasting Authority (SBA) was given full legal range to manage the entire nation's Internet using policy. This authority was later transferred to the Media Development Authority (MDA) after the passage of the Media Development Authority of Singapore Act of 2003 (Lee 2010, 113). The MDA takes the "light-touch regulatory approach" by using the "Broadcasting (Class License) Notification" which places the duty of self-censorship on the providers and not on the individual³.

Print media is the final component. Local print media has a history of governmental controls. Starting in the 1980's there were politically motivated mergers and closures of newspaper companies throughout the country (Lee 2010, 130). With the lessening number of outlets, the emergence of the Singapore Press Holding (SPH), a government-linked company, quickly took hold of the market and became a monopoly. Although this merger was successful, the freedom of the press was now limited to government allowed expression. The PAP had acquired the ability to censor a thriving local media outlet which would not allow for any opinions that challenged its authority.

³ All Licensees must follow restrictions outlined by the Class License Conditions and Internet Code of Practice, [KPI] these list what the MDA considers to be "offensive or harmful to Singapore's racial and religious harmony". Self-regulatory obligation must be met by the content provider or risk facing prosecution from the state.

Singapore's government has created safeguards that have previously shielded them from transnational interventions by global actors. Singapore has attempted to create a perception of liberalization in its control. This facade masks the true nature of Singapore's civil society where it is still nearly impossible for local NGOs to effect change. Liberalization of civil society has been under state-mandated regulations that have permitted only non-threatening civil society organizing. The prime minister labeled this stage of change their attempt at "openness", which distinguishes Singapore's band of liberalization from a society-run version. Liberalizing civil society headed by non-governmental organizations uses a different set of mechanisms and sets an agenda for true freedoms not regulated by authoritative rule. Mechanisms used by civic liberalization that distinguish it from Singapore's "openness" is non-regulated speech and reporting through transnational means, media exposure, and transnational organizing (Baber 2002; Gomez 2005; Ortmann 2015).

Transnational organization and local NGO collaboration is paramount for successful advocacy for foreign domestic workers in Singapore. As I have already indicated, local non-governmental organizations have been working to advocate for the rights of migrant workers in Singapore but have faced particular constraints set out by Singapore's authoritarian People's Action Party (PAP). Since PAP controls advocacy in civil society through registry and blockers, media control, it has effectively rendered local actors silent when reporting within the country. Thus, advocacy for migrants has to come from not just the local but also from transnational organizations. Local NGOs in Singapore have been collecting data and information on abuse and exploitation that migrant workers face.

Collaborative successes

The three areas of success in which local and transnational NGOS collaborated are: The Evidence Act and Criminal Procedure Code amendment, the passing of The Human Trafficking Act, implementation of National Workers Safety and Health (WSH) Strategy. The local NGOS involved in these cases are the TWC2 and HOME. Transient Workers Count Too (TWC2) is a local NGO that is in direct resistance to the Singaporean government's legislation and policy framework (Mathews and Soon 2015, 73). The pivotal moment that led to the intensity of this group's work was the death of an Indonesian domestic worker's death after she had been beaten for months prior. They mainly focus on public awareness and research-based advocacy. The Humanitarian Organization for Migration Economics (HOME) is a non-governmental organization established in 2004 to respond to the urgent needs of the migrant community, especially low-wage migrant workers, in Singapore. HOME has been granted United Nations ECOSOC status, and provides services to thousands of migrant workers in need through the provision of shelter, legal assistance, training, and rehabilitation programs. In the last five years, HOME has provided shelter to approximately 3,500 migrant domestic workers" (HOME 2018, 1).

Both NGOs have collected data on Singapore's foreign domestic workers and have been actively aiding these women. These organizations have ties with 209 actors within the region, such as civil society groups, trade unions, associations of migrant workers and individual actors. (Mathews and Soon 2015, 75). TWC2 and HOME are key contributors to data on foreign domestic worker exploitation, this information has been used by the International Labor Organization in understanding the scale of the issue.

Case 1&2: Evidence Act and Criminal Procedure Code Amendment, and The Human Trafficking Act

Human trafficking is a dark corner of the foreign domestic worker market globally, this includes Singapore. Forced labor is not an uncommon occurrence and has been addressed by local and transnational actors. Transnational and local migrant and human rights groups worked together to create a coalition to raise awareness for human rights violations, including migrant workers abuse, with the StopTraffickingSG campaign (Mathews and Soon 2015, 75). Local NGOs, HOME and TWC2, coupled with the support of transnational organizations, UNWomen and Arming Women Against Rape & Endangerment (AWARE), were able to present a petition to Member of Parliament Christopher De Souza. This petition, with 1,050 signatures, urged the PAP to support a “victim centric approach”, where migrants that faced abuse, either through trafficking or forced labor, would not be penalized due to their temporary or illegal status (Mathews and Soon 2015, 75). The petition was able to reach parliamentary level since local actors, HOME and TWC2, were able to collaborate with transnational organizations that had more leverage to petition a government and be heard. Their campaign had more weight which became unavoidable by the PAP. Singapore has made efforts to change its laws surrounding trafficked and abused women, they amended the Evidence Act and Criminal Procedure Code. In doing this they made policy that would allow police to more easily identify, investigate and prosecute offenders (AWARE 2011, 1). Another effective change that came about due to the petition and increased global awareness of trafficking in Singapore was the passing of The Human Trafficking Act that makes all forms of trafficking, including forced labor, illegal and would be penalized with up to ten years in jail and 100,000 Singaporean dollars in fines (Republic of Singapore).

Case 3: National Workers Safety and Health (WSH) Strategy

With the information provided by local NGOs about the lack of safety measures in the work environments of migrant workers the ILO held a convention in to address this issue. In 2006 the ILO Convention 187, a Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention, convened with the intention of creating a global standard for migrant worker health and safety. This convention convened to address the global issue surrounding workers health and safety, it urged countries to take political action to reduce injuries and ensure the wellbeing of the mainly migrant labor force. In 2012 Singapore announced that they would ratify the C187. The Ministry of Manpower's Commissioner for Safety and Health has stated that Singapore has started to implement a National Workers Safety and Health (WSH) Strategy 2018 that would create sustainable improvements to WSH Standards already in place. They took the C187 and made a change in the way that they will handle WSH and will change the way the government will oversee and take responsibility for migrant workers abuse. These improvements have seen to a reduction in the death toll of migrant workers, the government has also taken a hands-on approach to migrant health and safety.

Ongoing Case: Human Rights Commission

Foreign domestic workers are subject to human rights violations while working in the homes of Singaporean residents. These violations include but are not limited to physical and sexual abuse, forced labor and inadequate living conditions. Solidarity for Migrant Workers, a joint coalition of HOME, TWC2 and Migrant Voices made a submission to the 11th session of the UN's Universal Periodic Review (Mathews and Soon 2015, 76). They urged for the creation

of an independent Human Rights Commission that operated on the local level in Singapore, they would open an investigation and report on human rights violations in Singapore (Mathews and Soon 2015, 76). This would be coupled with the support and ratification of the ILO Convention Concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers (Domestic Workers Convention, No. 189). Governments, agencies, employers and unions all voted to implement a treaty that would establish decent rights for all domestic workers around the world. This was the first international treaty implemented by governments that had to do with abuse and exploitation that domestic workers face in the workplace. Local and transnational organizations are still fighting for the local Human Rights Commission to be implemented as well as waiting for Singapore to address and ratify C189.

Analysis

Through the course of this research it is clear foreign domestic workers are limited in their avenues of self-advocacy. They have been excluded from routes that would give them agency to petition the governments for comprehensive protections and rights. Local NGOs are also hindered from advocating effectively as they are limited by the policy that requires specific obedience to the PAPs carefully constructed civil society. The PAPs authoritative position to governing has created measures to ensure it continues to be unchallenged by any local organization. They have created policies that restrict the powers of civil society organizations so that there is no possibility of a collective that could be in direct opposition with the government. The PAPs restrictions also include organizations that advocate for the rights of migrant workers. These types of groups are seen as threatening to the PAP, while advocating for migrant rights

NGOs in the past have highlighted faults in policy structures⁴. Although the state has never publicly remarked on migrant worker advocacy being an OB marker, the previous shutdown of Geylang Catholic Center for Foreign Workers in their plight for migrant worker rights, has made it clear the governments resistance on this topic.

Transnational organizations are paramount for advocacy in Singapore. Local organizations are key in advocacy as they are the on-the-ground networks that collect the necessary information regarding migrant workers and more specifically foreign domestic worker abuse. This information is then used by larger transnational organizations, these larger groups are able to petition the Singaporean government to implement changes regarding foreign domestic workers rights. Altering the policies of an authoritative state is difficult, transnational organizations have made efforts to make real world changes for foreign domestic worker suffering abuse. In the case of C187 Singapore was required to comply with the requirements stipulated to ensure the safety of migrant workers. The PAP made steps to ensure that the WSH had made regulatory reform which would increase penalties on companies and agencies found in defiance.

⁴ In 1987, twenty-two people activists that included workers of the Geylang Catholic Center for Foreign Workers and several members of AWARE were arrested under the Internal Security Act. The issues that they were advocating for were for higher wages, social security benefits and employment conditions for all foreign workers (Lyons 2004, 6). They were accused of threatening the state and national interests and to be a part of a 'Marxist conspiracy'. The state claimed that the "Catholic organization was a cover for political agitation" to 'radicalise students and Christian activists'" (Lyons 2004, 6).

Lyons, Lenore T. 2004. "Organizing for Domestic Worker Rights in Singapore: The Limits of Transnationalism." *Feminist Politics, Activism and Vision: Local and Global Challenges*, 149-168.

Conclusion

Although collaborations between local and transnational actors are not always successful in implementing policy changes, like in the case of C187 and StopTraffickingSG campaign, they have made strides in addressing foreign domestic worker rights. Without the help of TNGOs foreign domestic worker abuse would be a silent struggle being tackled only by ineffective local NGOs. TNGOs have created an open discussion that involves not only Singapore but other nations globally that are either advocating for migrant worker rights or have similar situations to Singapore that need to be addressed. Foreign domestic workers are a part of a global network of transient women many of which experience abuse due policies in place. Having local Singaporean NGOs contributing information to transnational actors on foreign domestic workers strengthens the coalition of migrant rights as a whole.

References

- Baber, Zaheer. 2002. "Engendering or Endangering Democracy? The Internet, Civil Society and the Public Sphere." *Asian Journal of Social Science* 30 (2): 287–303.
- Bal, Charanpal S. 2015. "Production Politics and Migrant Labour Advocacy in Singapore." *Journal of Contemporary Asia* 45 (2): 219–42.
- Gomez, James. 2005. "International NGOs: Filling the 'Gap' in Singapore's Civil Society." *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 20 (2): 177–207.
- Haque, M. Shamsul. 2018. "The Changing Relationship between the State and the Voluntary Philanthropic Sector: Special Reference to Singapore." *Asian Journal of Political Science* 26 (1): 103–20.
- Keck, Margaret E. and Kathryn Sikkink. 1998. *Activists beyond Borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics*. Cornell University Press.
- Lee, Terence. 2010. *The Media, Cultural Control and Government in Singapore*. Routledge Media, Culture and Social Change in Asia. London: Routledge.
- Lee, Terence. 2005. "Gestural Politics: Civil Society in 'New' Singapore." *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 20 (2): 132–54.
- Lyons, Lenore. 2005. "Transient Workers Count Too? The Intersection of Citizenship and Gender in Singapore's Civil Society." *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 20 (2): 208–48.
- Lyons, Lenore. and James Gomez. 2005. "Moving Beyond the OB Markers: Rethinking the Space of Civil Society in Singapore." *Sojourn: Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 20 (2): 119–31.
- Mathews, Mathew and Debbie Soon. 2015. "Immigration and the Role of Civil Society in Singapore" *Asia on the Move: Regional Migration and the Role of Civil Society*. 65-81.
- Mitchell, George E. and Hans Peter Schmitz. 2014. "Principled instrumentalism: A theory of transnational NGO behavior." *Review of International Studies* 40 (3): 487-504.
- Ng, Eve. 2018. "LGBT Advocacy and Transnational Funding in Singapore and Malaysia." *Development and Change* 49 (4): 1093–1114.
- Nowrasteh, Alex. 2018. "Singapore's Immigration System: Past, Present, and Future." *CATO Institute*, 33.
- Ortmann, Stephan. 2012. "Policy Advocacy in a Competitive Authoritarian Regime: The Growth

- of Civil Society and Agenda Setting in Singapore.” *Administration & Society* 44 (6): 13-25.
- Rodan, Garry. 1998. "The Internet and Political Control in Singapore." *Political Science Quarterly* 113 (1): 63-89.
- Rodan, Garry. 1996. "State-society relations and political opposition in Singapore." *Political Opposition in Industrialising Asia*, 95-127.
- Tay, Simon S.C. 1998. "Towards a Singaporean Civil Society." *Southeast Asian Affairs*, 244–61.
- Teng, Yap Mui, Gillian Koh, and Debbie Soon. 2014. *Migration and Integration in Singapore: Policies and Practice*. Routledge.
- Thangavelu, Shandre Mugan. 2017. "Labour Market Integration with the World: Case of Singapore." *Journal of Economic Integration* 32 (3): 723–58.
- "Article 6: Trafficking and Exploitation of Women". 2011. AWARE, Accessed April 7, 2020
- "Behind Closed Doors: Forced Labour in the Domestic Work Sector in Singapore". 2019. HOME. Accessed March 16, 2020.
- Experian (2019). *The Value of Care: Key Contributions of Migrant Domestic Workers to Economic Growth and Family Well-being in Asia*.
- "Foreign Workers in Singapore." n.d. AP Migration. Accessed March 9, 2020. <http://apmigration.ilo.org/news/singapore-and-foreign-workers>.
- Frost & Sullivan. 2019. *A migrant domestic worker landscape in Hong Kong, Singapore, and Malaysia*.
- Republic of Singapore. *Government Gazette. Prevention of Human Trafficking Act of 2014*. No. 45. 2014.
- "Singapore Population." n.d. Base. Accessed March 10, 2020. <http://www.singstat.gov.sg/modules/infographics/population>
- "Thematic Report on Domestic Servitude of Migrant Women and Girls". 2018. HOME. Accessed March 9, 2020.
- .