

5-2020

Subtractive Bilingualism: Encouraged by English-Only in Schools, Affecting First Language

Aurora Jimenez
California State University, Monterey Bay

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps_thes_all



Part of the [Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons](#), and the [Elementary Education Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Jimenez, Aurora, "Subtractive Bilingualism: Encouraged by English-Only in Schools, Affecting First Language" (2020). *Capstone Projects and Master's Theses*. 879.
https://digitalcommons.csumb.edu/caps_thes_all/879

This Capstone Project (Open Access) is brought to you for free and open access by the Capstone Projects and Master's Theses at Digital Commons @ CSUMB. It has been accepted for inclusion in Capstone Projects and Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ CSUMB. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@csumb.edu.

Subtractive Bilingualism: Encouraged by English-only in Schools, Affecting First Language

Aurora Jimenez

Liberal Studies Department

College of Education

California State University of Monterey Bay

April 25, 2020

Abstract:

The lack of bilingual education in schools, leads children to be more socially engaged in English. This report aims to answer how it is that language develops? What role does bilingualism play in language development? How is subtractive bilingualism influenced by social interactions? This capstone project illustrates how English Language Learners (ELL) without bilingual language support might have a negative impact on their overall language development. Social interactions have a lot to do in language development and acquisition, and people grow to rely more on one language (which is known as subtractive bilingualism). This project bases its information on a literature review regarding bilingual education, and a case study conducted of a 3rd grade student, who has started to develop signs of subtractive bilingualism.

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

Subtractive Bilingualism Being Encouraged by English-only in Schools, Affecting First Language

Growing up, my first language was primarily Spanish. My family would only talk to me in Spanish, and as a little girl I believed that there was no other language than Spanish. This was mainly due to the fact that I first started school in primarily Spanish language. I first learned to read and write in Spanish and it was not until the beginning of third grade that I was aware that there existed other languages, like English for example. From being primarily in contact with the Spanish language all my life, all of a sudden things took a 180 degree turn. Now I was expected to learn the dominant language (English).

I had imagined that learning to read in English would be like learning to read in Spanish, which was not really the case. My journey learning English was not as smooth as I had once imagined. It was full of struggles and headaches. Mainly because the way that one speaks English is not the same way that it is written. In Spanish, there is a sound and symbol correspondence, which is something that contrasts it from English (in which the sound and symbol correspondence has much irregularities as compared with Spanish). Learning English for me took some time. After a few months, I started speaking fluently in English. Popular culture would have people believe that I was able to learn English quickly because I was in contact with it most of the day (in school), and because as a child, I had the ability to pick up languages in a rather quick manner. Perhaps my advantage was that I had learned to read fairly well in Spanish already before I was forced into English-only in school. In my case, I was engaged in talking English (at school) and Spanish (at home), I continued to read in Spanish and eventually was able to translate from Spanish to English for my parents. I often read the mail to

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

them, and for some words I had to use a bilingual dictionary (mainly to make sure that in my translation I was using the correct words from English to Spanish).

As a result, I grew up in a rather bilingual manner, using both Spanish and English. At some point during high school and college I was enrolled in some classes of Spanish for heritage speakers. Taking some Spanish classes, I thought that they would be easy classes, since the fact that I grew up speaking that language. To my surprise that was not really the case, even if I already had some knowledge of the basics of how to read and write in Spanish, the classes I took helped me understand the language a little more and in a way, it helped me make connections to English. I started to notice how two very different languages, like that of English and Spanish hold some similarities in some of the grammar rules and they also have cognate words that show the similarity a word has regarding the spelling and the overall meaning and that a word could have in English and in Spanish.

Given my own success, I was puzzled when I met a woman who only speaks Spanish, complaining that her daughter by third grade has lost her Spanish and now speaks primarily English (at school and in their house). Her situation is very concerning to me and became the inspiration for this capstone investigation. I was triggered to study this case more profoundly, and look for some of the factors that could be influencing this language shift in a school age child that is starting to lose communication in what was her first language. This is something that I find troubling because it completely contrasts with that of my story and impacts her mother's ability to parent effectively. This paper seeks to answer the questions of how is it that language is developed? What role does bilingualism play in language development? How is subtractive bilingualism influenced by social interaction?

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

Literature Review

Language as a Right

The language a person speaks is tied to cultural identity and represents every aspect of a child's life (Wright, 2019). Schools want all students to succeed, and achieve their goals. However, when a child enters school speaking a language other than the dominant culture language, schools must address the learning needs of the child. This conflict between the language identity and development of a child and the goal of education to prepare citizens for the workforce has presented a challenge to U.S. educators.

This conflict was first argued in the court case of Lau vs. Nichols in 1974. Since that time, the U.S. has had a complex and contentious history with regard to bilingual education, such that today, the question of a child's language ability is asked upon enrollment. Students are automatically identified as either English Language Proficient (ELP), English as a Second Language (ESL), or English Language Learner (ELL) (Garcia, Kleifgen & Falchi, 2008). Moreover, these labels also form their social identity categorizing them in school.

The practices of Bilingual education have changed over time (Sanchez, Garcia, & Solorza, 2018). Sanchez et al, refer to bilingual students as somewhat special. When it comes to languages they could bring in what they know in one language, and use that knowledge and employ it to what they are learning. Sanchez et al, just like Wright (2019) describes how policies regarding bilingual education have been changing over time, and how these policies do not really seem to be helping ELLs. The fact of enrolling students that might have just migrated to the US, or students that at home talk in another language, straight into English only (while in school) might not be the best way of helping them learn. Wright (2019) describes a movement

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

which argues that language is a right and how language should be used to help students, and not make them forget or abolish the language that they utilize at home while they are in school.

ELLs support programs offered in school and development in language learning

For the most part when it comes to helping ELL students learn English, schools implement some programs that are designed especially for them and help all students succeed. Garcia, Kleifgen, and Falchi (2008) describe such programs, which include submersion programs, or what they refer to as the “sink or swim”, characterized by English only, where both ELLs and non-ELLs are expected to succeed without any other intervention. Garcia et al. (2008) refer to it in this manner because for many ELLs in that situation they either sink (hardly learn, and school becomes difficult for them) or swim (they get the most out of it, and actually succeed and eventually learn English). Another program that is very common for many schools to offer is the pull-out program. The pull-out program is designed to offer support for all students that are learning English as a second language. This program could actually be considered as being the most common and practiced program designed to help ELL students.

One problem with the pull-out approach is that students lose instructional time and they feel labeled as being different because they are pulled out. The impact of pull-out programs often makes students feel more marginalized. However, inside the classroom, students participate in one way or another to show what they are learning, or if they are learning anything at all. When it comes to ELLs, some might not really feel comfortable sharing out loud because they develop a mentality that their language abilities are not as good as the rest of their peers. This affects their confidence academically as well, which has been suggested that this is one reason why ELLs have the highest dropout rates (West, 2016).

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

Walqui (2019), expresses the importance of oracy. Walqui describes “oracy” as the way students talk, and how they are developing their language skills. Development of language skills is a very important aspect of Language Learning, because language consists of 3 main aspects (speaking, reading and writing) and they are all fundamental to learning. Walqui points out how dialogue is an important aspect when it comes to learning and engaging students. It could be used like another method to get students engaged, and express their ideas about various different concepts. It is actually beneficial, because it is giving out the opportunity of increasing language practice in ELLs and actually helps them in the new language acquisition, which in many occasions is the culturally dominant language (English). However, because students may not feel comfortable participating, Walqui recommends teachers strategically find ways for ELLs to participate in class and feel a member of the learning community.

One strong language, and one weak language

While in school, English is the primary language, and it is desired that all students utilize English only in schools. Cha and Goldenberg (2015) point out a very common belief that if parents really want their children to learn English, they should only be in contact with the English language. This is the case of many ELL families. They want their children to really succeed in school and that makes them want their children to only interact in English so that they are exposed to that language and really learn it (or really get the most out of it). Some students come into school knowing other languages, but as soon as they enter school they forget such languages. Over time, their English skills may really improve, but their skills in any other language start to vanish. Cha and Goldenberg (2015), point to this phenomenon as having one dominant language. The interaction in mainly one language for a long-time results in students’

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

tendency of using that language a little bit more. They describe this language usage and/or phenomena as early signs of subtractive bilingualism.

Austin, Blume, and Sanchez (2013), just like Cha and Goldenberg talk about some of the effects of English only in schools. Austin, et al. (2013) suggests that children are mainly interacting in English at school, which leads to children developing a better understanding of English, by the fact that it is the language they are hearing in school, and the one that they have to interact in. School is a place where children spend a lot of time, so it becomes logical that children often rely on English as a form of communication. Children start to show signs of subtractive bilingualism in their first language. Signs of subtractive bilingualism is nothing out of the ordinary, in fact it is very common in some children when they are learning a second language, which could be logically accepted because English is starting to become their main method of communication (not only in school, but also out of school).

Wong-Fillmore (1991), also points out how once children enter school, and start developing language acquisition in one language, they would turn to show signs of losing some of their home language (s). Wong-Fillmore suggests that English becomes the main language since students are forced to learn it, and they end up using it in their everyday lives a little more than usual. With time, this leads to diminishing their language practices of their first language. Wong-Fillmore claims that in part the phenomenon of subtractive bilingualism has to do with the decrease of bilingual education in school (mainly concerning with the children's first language), and leads the students to express themselves more fluently in one language than in another. Unfortunately, this problem became even more evident under No Child Left Behind legislation. When Garcia et al (2008), writing, the country was in a period when bilingual education was

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

disappearing little by little, which closed important language support for many students who were aiming to learn English as a new language

Translanguaging usage and effect

Kleyn and Garcia (2019), introduce translanguaging as a way of helping people interact with one another. Kleyn and Garcia describe translanguaging as a tool that helps students acquire language skills. Translanguaging is beneficial because it helps students bring in prior knowledge to help them build new knowledge. This could begin to ease the struggles they might face when they are learning a new language. If they are able to connect it with something that they know and understand, learning the “new language” could become slightly less challenging. Hopewell and Gonzalez (2019), describe translanguaging as a way of embracing communities, cultures and identities. Applying known concepts and ideas to new material (or in fact a new language). If someone is learning a new language they could come up with a better understanding of new ideas, by connecting it in one way or another to a language that they already know.

Rowe (2018), also describes translanguaging as an intermix of ideas that connect one language (first language) to a new language (second language), which helps students connect their lives outside of school to those inside of school. Rowe suggests that taking into consideration what the student is and what he/she represents could be helpful when it comes to teaching them. This is a way of connecting with the student and taking many things into consideration when it comes to looking for ways to help or in fact scaffold children’s learning. Sayer (2013) points out how accepting and acknowledging the various languages that people have, and in a way implementing them in the classroom could signify and lead to making a culturally relevant classroom. Building a culturally relevant language into classroom practices

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

helps students feel identified and have a supporting language (home language/s) which helps them in their overall learning (mainly acquiring the English language). Rowe (2018) also suggests that translanguaging is not bad for anyone. It is in fact beneficial because it helps others make sense of what really is going on in their lives, especially for children who are developing in their heritage. It is unjust and unfair if they have to say bye to their home language, just because they are aiming to learn a new language. If this was to happen it could lead to losing family communication, culture and part of their identity, because they will not have a common language to communicate.

Translanguaging as a Theoretical Framework

Vogel, and Garcia (2017) and Garcia, Ibarra-Johnson and Seltzer (2017) portray Cen Williams as the first one to coin translanguaging in 1994. Williams developed a bilingual pedagogy in which students were asked to alternate languages for the purposes of receptive or productive use (Garcia et al., 2017, p. 2). Translanguaging being the main tool to teach; alternating from one language to the other, which is aimed to bring prior knowledge and use it to develop new knowledge. Garcia et al. point out how language is there to help people interact with one another and if there are some people who know more than one language, they should utilize all languages and make the best out of them. The more you know, the better off you are. Languages have the capability of bringing in different cultures, which gives us the opportunity of bringing in different languages in the classroom. In the long run, it gives us the opportunity to maximize our knowledge and learn a little about what other languages have within them. In other words, translanguaging supports cognitive, social-emotional, and linguistic abilities, by providing a bridge and connecting what students know in one language and using it to understand something that they are learning in a new language.

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

Garcia et al. point out some of the purposes of translanguaging: 1. supporting students as they engage with and comprehend complex content and texts; 2. providing opportunities for students to develop linguistic practices for academic contexts; 3. making space for students' bilingualism and ways of knowing; and 4. supporting students' bilingual identities and socioemotional development (p. 7). This portrays translanguaging like other methods of teaching (which has a clear purpose), that is, to help students in various ways when it comes to learning. Translanguaging in the classroom is just another way of scaffolding the learning of the students, and helping them develop better understanding of what they are learning in school. By engaging in translanguaging students would have the opportunity of developing both of the languages that children interact with in their daily lives (taking into consideration the home language and the language they utilize in school). Translanguaging could in a way start to erase what Austin et al. (2013), Cha and Goldenberg (2015), and Wong-Fillmore (1991) portray as subtractive bilingualism. All of these ties back to the question of how is it that we develop language. Given the importance of social context on the development of bilingualism, how is subtractive bilingualism influenced by social interactions? I now turn to my investigation of a child who appears to be losing her mother's tongue.

Method

For this paper, I conducted a case study on a school age child whose first language is Spanish. She began to learn English when she entered school in Kindergarten. The child's home language consisted primarily of the Spanish language. The child lives with a single mother, who only speaks Spanish. The mother has never really had time to learn English. She can understand some of the basic words of English but does not know how to speak fluently in it or even write it. The mother works in the agricultural fields and lives in a small town in which the majority of the

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

population has Spanish as the first language. Since I was to work with a minor I talked to the parent (mother in this case), to let her know the purpose of this research paper. The parent verbally agreed, and later I obtained signed consent from the parent as per the Human Subject Research requirement at a university. After obtaining the signed consent, I began to work with the student. Due to the COVID-19, I was only able to work with the student one day in a face-to-face manner. Then our meetings were converted to a virtual manner, using technology (Facetime) as we sheltered in place. From the short meeting sessions with the child, I was able to gather some information on her language practices. For example, how the student utilizes the languages she knows and speaks in her everyday life. I also investigated whether or not she has a preferred language to communicate or if she is more fluent in one language than the other.

Procedure

The short interactions I conducted with the child consisted of engaging in a discussion in the child's first language and second language (Spanish and English). First it consisted of mainly discussing the child's homework, as a way to get to know the child and make the child feel comfortable, spending time with me, so that the child could really engage in the discussions. The child's homework was primarily in English, in which the child would read some English comprehension passages that the teacher had assigned. The child would read the passages aloud, and then discuss what she understood about them. After doing some homework, we engaged in a conversation that was primary in Spanish. It was through the Spanish conversation that I would be able to get a little more insight of her language development in that of the child's first language and compare it to that of the child's second language.

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

Findings

Working with the child I was able to have a better picture of her language practices. Some of the things that I noticed in regards to her language practices are that when it comes to speaking to others, if she knows that you speak English, that is the language that she uses to communicate. It is as if it is easier for her to speak in English to people and it comes out in a rather more natural way. Natural meaning that she did not have to stop and think about what she wanted to say; she just said it. This really contrasted that to her way of speaking Spanish. If she communicated in Spanish she had to make a pause, and she thought about what she really wanted to express. It was as if she had a puzzle in her mind, and she was deciphering piece by piece, where her thoughts came in English. However, the words that came out of her mouth were in Spanish.

At times, when she wanted to express something in Spanish it seemed as if she was translating word per word what she wanted to say from the English to that of Spanish. For example, the child wanted to express that she wanted to rest ten more minutes using Spanish, she said “diez más minutos,” which is correct, but it is not typical form for people to speak in Spanish. It is rather correct but it does not quite sound right. In Spanish the most common way to say “ten more minutes” is saying “diez minutos mas.” The child translated word per word an English phrase to that of Spanish, but translating something from English to Spanish impacts the syntax, making some of the order of the words switch places. The meaning and the child’s overall point was made; it was understandable but it was not the typical way of saying it in Spanish.

Another thing that I noticed was that when the child was talking in her first language (Spanish), she often forgot how to say a particular word and borrowed it from the English

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

language and used it to communicate some of her ideas. For example, when she was talking about a typical day for her in school, she mentioned how some girls in her class were a little annoying because they were always following her. The child expressed this thought in Spanish and borrowed an English word in her communication “unas niñas me hacen annoy porque siempre me siguen.” The manner in which the child utilized an English word in a pretty much Spanish sentence shadows that of translanguaging (intermix of two languages to express an idea).

Furthermore, after some sessions working with the student it became visible that her strongest language has become her second language (English). The child would utilize English for most of the time, and when directed to speak in her first language (Spanish) she struggled a little more. It was more as if she had to make a pause in her head to digest what she had just listened to and then think of a way to put her thoughts together and communicate them using Spanish. She sometimes forgot how to say particular words in Spanish, so she would either borrow the word from English and use it when it came to talking Spanish. The child overall seemed to comprehend most of the Spanish that she would hear, but sometimes she would ask what that would mean in English to have a better understanding. The child’s social interactions being primarily in English has made English her stronger language and form of communication.

Discussion

Learning a new language is very different for people. Some are able to pick up languages in a rather easier and faster way than others. The way that a language is picked up, and developed is different for everyone. I have met people that just by watching or just listening to another language they are able to pick up that language, but I have also met people that go to school or take a foreign language class but do not seem to learn “the new language.” Language

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

development is something that is important, because it is the basis of communication, and everyone has to communicate in one way or another to the people around them, no matter if it is around family, friends, teachers, and etc. Language takes many different forms according to the setting that people are in, for example it could be in a party, school, work, house etc. and the language used takes a slight shift from one another (shifting from a rather informal language to that of a more formal and vice versa).

Just as people are able to pick up languages, people are also forgetting some of the language(s) that they speak. This is something that happens when one language is not really being used in your daily life. The particular language that is not really being used starts to fade away, and before it could be noticed, it starts to disappear little by little. This is something that in the long run could end up harming the communication people have, especially within a family if some members' only source of communication is through that particular language. Many times, people start to become a little more fluent with one language, because they interact with that language a little more. This is something that is normally seen in U.S. schools where English is the only language that is being taught (Wong-Fillmore 1991).

Limitations

The time I was able to work with the child was limited due to the COVID-19. I was not able to work with the child in the manner that I had planned, since we had to avoid social interactions as we sheltered in place. The overall virtual interactions consisted of short conversations with the child in which the child would talk about her day and was encouraged to use both of the languages that she speaks (especially that of her first language). Another limitation that this paper has is the number of participants. Since this paper only contained one

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

participant it cannot suggest that the results would be the same for everyone. There needs to be more analysis and a greater number of participants to more accurately make an overall generalization.

Conclusion

Some of the major learning outcomes (MLO) that are address in this paper are: MLO #1- Developing Educator, and MLO # 4- Social Justice Collaborator. MLO#1 involves and explores how children are being expected to utilize their languages into learning. MLO#4 involves what a parent points to as having a more challenging relationship with their child, now that the child has started to lose communication with the parent since the child has started to rely in a language that the parent does not dominate. And more precisely what is it that the parents think about their children being exposed to their home language in school.

Schools have been shifting gears regarding bilingual education, that in a way have started to influence the language(s) that are being used by students and teachers. Bilingual education laws have been constantly changing, and due to some of those changes there was a time in which schools in California were converted into English only. The idea of not having other languages taught and spoken in school was mainly to reinforce the English language in students.

In California we recently passed proposition 58, which has brought back insights of bilingual education back into school districts. Still, English is the dominant language in schools, and that is affecting any other languages that are spoken by students. Some students feel more comfortable speaking in English and have started to show signs of subtractive bilingualism, which mainly refers to the start of losing the first language or mother tongue, because English is being used a little more in children's lives. This could be seen as something that is good (since students are becoming more fluent in English) and bad (because students will not really be

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

using/practicing their first language, and it could lead to forgetting it). If aspects of subtractive bilingualism start to become more common in children, this change could end up harming them because they might start to lose communication with part of their families that do not speak English. Social interactions have a huge impact on language use, many times could be beneficial, but it could also become something harmful.

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

References

- Wright, W. E. (2019). Language rights and policy in K-12 TESOL.
- Hopewell, S., Gonzalez P.A. (2019) ¿Por qué estamos code- switching? Understanding language use in a second-grade classroom, *Bilingual Research Journal*, 42:1, 105-120, DOI: 10.1080/15235882.2018.1561554
- Kleyn, T. and Garcia, O. (2019). Translanguaging as an act of transformation.
- Walqui, A. (2019). Shifting from teaching of oral skills to the development of oracy.
- Sanchez, M. T., Garcia, O., Solorza, C. (2018). Reframing language allocation policy in dual language bilingual education. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 41:1, 37-51, DOI: 10.1080/15235882.2017.1405098
- Rowe, W. L. (2018). Say It in Your Language: Supporting Translanguaging in Multilingual Classes. *International Literacy Association*. Vol. 72(1). Retrieved from: <https://onlinelibrary-wiley-com.library2.csumb.edu:2248/doi/full/10.1002/trtr.1673>
- Sayer, P. (2013). Translanguaging, TexMex, and Bilingual Pedagogy: Emergent Bilinguals Learning Through the Vernacular. *TESOL Quarterly*, Vol. 47, No.1, p.p. 63-88. Retrieved from: https://www-jstor-org.library2.csumb.edu:2248/stable/43267774?seq=1#metadata_info_tab_contents
- Cha, K., & Goldenberg, C. (2015). The complex relationship between bilingual home language input and kindergarten children's Spanish and English oral proficiencies. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 107(4), 935–953. <https://doi-org.library2.csumb.edu:2248/10.1037/edu0000030.supp> (Supplemental)
- Austin, J., Blume, M., Sanchez, L. (2013). Syntactic Development in the L1 of Spanish-English Bilingual Children. *Hispania* (Vol. 96(3) pp. 542-561). Retrieved from:

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

<https://www-jstor-org.library2.csUMB.edu:2248/stable/pdf/23608295.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3Add0e676ed9bc36f7d23641124820348e>

Wong-Fillmore, L. (1991). When Learning a Second Language Means Losing the First. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly* (Vol. 6, pp. 323-346) Retrieved from:

<https://somalikidsbook.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/When-second-language-mean-losing-first-.pdf>

Vogel, S., Garcia, O. (2017). *Translanguaging. Languages and Literacies*. DOI:

10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.013.181. Retrieved from

<https://oxfordre.com/education/view/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.001.0001/acrefore-9780190264093-e-181?print=pdf>

Gracia, O., Ibarra-Johnson, S., Seltzer, K. (2017). *The Translanguaging Classroom: Levering Students Bilingualism for Learning*. Caslon, Inc.

Garcia, O., Kleifgen, J. A., Falchi, L. (2008). From English Language Learners to Emergent Bilinguals. *Equity Matters: Research Review* No. 1.

West, S. (2016). Native Hispanic long-term English language learners' experiences in the public system. ProQuest Dissertation and Thesis. Retrieved from:

<https://search.proquest.com/docview/1859946508/?pq-origsite=primo>

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

Appendices

Notes Gathered from Case Study:

Day #1 (3/13/20):

- To begin I engaged with the child in homework help
 - For the most part the homework consisted on simple multiplication problems
 - As well as some vocabulary words (filling up the blank & word puzzle)
 - A time reading pertaining to wildlife
- While doing the homework I noticed that the child was pretty good understanding what she was do
 - She would read the instructions of what was it that she had to do
 - In the meantime, I pretended not to understand them so that I could have her perspective on what was she getting out of the questions
 - Her way of explaining what she was to do was very direct, involved point out to the examples she had in her paper, and relying in only English while she was explaining (it was pretty much acceptable since it was all written in English)
 - After the homework was finished she put her materials away
- We then engaged in a small little conversation about how her week had been in school
 - she used very much detail describing what she did with friends in school, and some of her favorite activities
 - I noticed that even though she was in 2nd grade, and taking into consideration that she had just learned English in Kinder & 1st grade she was very much fluid
- At some point her mom stepped into the conversation (I had previously talked to her mom to do so, so that she would give me the opportunity of collecting data, because I knew that if the mom didn't step in the student would not talk to me in Spanish)
- Then I signaled that I was going to turn the conversation to Spanish (so that her mom could understand)
- She agreed to do so
- When speaking in Spanish I noticed that the child had to stop for a while and think about what she was going to say
 - This was something that she didn't do when communicating her ideas in English
 - It was as if the pause she made before communicating her ideas to translate or process inside her head what she was going to say
 - Some of the words she would utilize were in some form of Spanish translation of the English word (like the word "annoy" she would say "unas ninas me hacen annoy porquet siempre me siguen" [some girls annoy me because they are always following me])
- At some point she would turn to me, and would start communicating her ideas in English
- She mentioned that talking in English was easier because she thought about them in that language
 - I would redirect the conversation back to Spanish
 - I would mention how it had to be in Spanish as a form of respect for her mom so that she could understand what was going on

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

DUE TO THE COVID-19 I WAS NOT ABLE TO MEET IN PERSON WITH THE CHILD I AM WORKING WITH, SO I TURNED TO TECHNOLOGY(FACETIME) TO CONTINUE GATHERING INFORMATION.

Day #2 (3/28/20):

- To begin I started by greeting the child
- We engaged in a small conversation in English
 - Mainly to ask how was she feeling with homework now that she wasn't able to go to school and had to only be working on completing homework packets
 - The child mentioned how it was a little boring and stressing to only be doing packets that consisted of reading and responding to some questions and confusing due to the fact that the math was something new for her and without her teacher helping explain how to do it.
- I then signaled that we would turn to Spanish for some time
- We began talking in Spanish
 - Her mom once again stepped in
 - I noticed that when talking in English the child didn't really have to think what she was going to say, she would just say it in a somewhat natural way
 - But when she was talking in Spanish she oftenly had to stop and think about what she really wanted to state
 - She would start looking up as a way to concentrate and think about what how to communicate her thoughts in Spanish
 - At times it would seem as if she was translating her thoughts from English to Spanish (doing it word for word)
 - Like for example if she wanted to say ten more minutes, in Spanish she would say "diez mas minutos" (her translation is correct, but that is not how you normally say ten more minutes in Spanish = the most common way to say it in Spanish is "diez minutos mas" [the words more minutes when talking in Spanish are reversed/flipped as if you are saying minutes more])
 - Also at times she would ask me in English how do you say a particular word in Spanish
 - Like we were talking about colors (which I think is something easy to express in both Spanish and English) but at times she would seem to forget the color names in Spanish and would say the names in English like instead of saying "cafe" she would say "brown" (Mi color favorito es el brown = My favorite color is brown)
 - The child started telling me that her mom works in the fields, and she doesn't understand why is it that her mom has to be working when the schools and many stores are closed due to the virus. (She said it in English)

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

- Since the mom didn't understand what she was saying she asked the child if she could say it in Spanish so that she could understand.
 - The child did turn to Spanish, but she had a hard time communicating her thoughts in Spanish. And she left out many of the details that she had used in English previously.
 - The child said "Yo no sabo como mi mom esta trabajando cuando todo está closed por el virus" = In English she basically said "I do not know, why my mom is working when everything is closed because of the virus"
 - Which is a shorter version of what she initially had said in English, used some English words and made up a word in Spanish to basically say "do not know" (sabo == she got it from the verb saber, or know in English)

Day # 3 (4/01/20):

- This time the child asked me if I could help her in some of her homework, so that it could be a little less boring for her. (which I think she meant that it was boring how she had to be doing homework without talking with anyone since in school much of the work they had to do involved talking with their peers)
- I agreed, but mentioned how when she was to read one of her passages if she could summarize what she understood verbally for me in Spanish
- So she started reading, she read about blue whales, and otters.
- In her reading (in English) she was very much fluent, and rarely had to stop and sound out some of the words that she was unfamiliar with.
- When she was done reading I asked her if she could give me a short summary of what she had read because I didn't really understand
 - Well she did give me a summary but she did it in English (and she really seemed to have comprehended what she had read about)
 - When I ask if she would briefly tell me about it in Spanish, she had a much harder time
 - And as in previous days she stopped and had to think about what she was going to say for quite a long time, she used some English when communicating her ideas in Spanish, and her summary this time was very much more simple
 - I noticed it was something challenging for her to do so I stopped asking her to tell me about her readings in Spanish and only rely in English in that part so that I wouldn't cause confusion in her
- After she read like 2 short passages, I signaled that it was time to talk in Spanish for a short time
- I started naming some cartoons that I would watch when I was younger, and asked her if she had watched as well (I purposely picked some cartoons that were well known to see if she could understand what I was talking about)
 - I named cartoons by its Spanish names like
 - Bob esponja = SpongeBob

RUNNING HEAD: SUBTRACTIVE BILINGUALISM

- Mickey Mouse = Mickey Mouse
- She seemed to understand what I was talking about and agreed that she had watched them.
- When I asked if she could describe some of the characters in Spanish
 - To describe SpongeBob, she used English words like (squarepants & sponge to describe it) “es una sponge amarilla que tiene squarepants”
 - It was logical her reasoning, and at times I felt as if she was using 2 languages at a same time or what we call Spanglish (a mix between Spanish and English)
- I also noticed that when using Spanish, it doesn't seem as if words come out naturally for her
- She has to stop and think about what she is going to say before actually expressing her ideas, which is something is very common to do but for people that are learning a new language (which in this case she had to think before using her first language Spanish)
- When she forgets how to say a particular word, she simply uses the English word and moves on with her thinking